Comments on two papers by Shubhoranjan Dasgupta

Ruchira Goswami

1. **Marxian Literary Debates and Discourses (Hereinafter Paper 1)**
2. **From Outspoken Admiration to Incisive Critique (Hereinafter Paper 2)**

Since the two papers are related, comments of both papers have been put together.

1. The genre of memoirs (paper 1) can include Jaya Mitra's *Hanyamaan* and Meenakshi Sen's *Jeler Bhetor Jel*.
2. Films on the Naxalite movement can include reference to *Hazarom Khowaishe Aisi* and *Hazar Chaurasi Ki Maa*
3. While I agree with with Dasgupta and Samaddar (Paper 2, p2-3) that written texts had limited reach compared to performances ie plays and songs – the question of how far reaching the mass songs were remains a question. Poems when made into songs of course had wider popularity like Bipul Chakraborty's *Biruddhotar Chabuk Othao Haate* or Partha Bandopadhyay's *Paayer Niche Phunshche Maati or Slogan ,* made widely popular by Pratul Mukhopadhaya's rendition*. B*ut the language and music scheme of Ganasangeet or mass songs were often more appreciated by and had more resonance among the middle class than the working class population.
4. More analysis required on what the author calls propagandist literature. Is party dictated literature/ performance necessarily propagandist and not of high artistic value. Debates in the IPTA raised by/over compositions of Salil Chowdhury. Who determines what is 'good' art – as discussed by Debabrata Biswas in ' *Bratyajaner Ruddhasangeet*'
5. What is construed as propagandist could be the subjective position of viewer/ audience or someone having a different world view – Reference could be made to some of Utpal Dutta's plays like *Duswapner Nagari*
6. Author has compared compositions of Subhash Mukhopadhyay with that of Gurudas Pal's. Can refer to Pal's *Thakile Dobakhana, Hobe Kachuripana* – a powerful, satirical song on the 1967 Hindu Sikh riot.. Also reference to Hemanga Biswas's songs like *Mountbatten Saheb Go* or *Nibaran Pandit's Murkha Gidal Hamra gula-* songs that are deeply political, responding to socio- political moments like the transfer of power in Biswas's *Mountbatten* or the Emergency in Pandit's Murkha Gidal.